

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: June 26, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: **David Morton, Acting-Chair**

Rodney Barker, Member

See Attendance List Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

ABSENT: Ellen Klapper, Alternate

> Nancy Grissom, Member Jean Fulkerson, Member Len Sherman, Alternate

Mark Armstrong, Member Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting-Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Armstrong, Barker, and Roesner. Alternate member Fitzmaurice voted. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device. The second item (515 Dudley Road) was not heard due to the owner's request to have it heard in July. The fifth agenda item, 49 Pelham Road, was discussed out of order to give the owners time to arrive. There were no owners present for 49 Pelham Road

City of Newton

Proposed fees for historic preservation

Candace Havens, Director of Planning and Development for the City of Newton, made a brief presentation on a city proposal to charge application fees for historic preservation Demo Delay and Certificate of Appropriateness applications. Ms. Havens said she preferred to have NHC take a vote taken on the measure, but after discussion by the NHC Commission, a positive consensus was reached on assessment of fees to help defray the cost of historic preservation reviews. The Commission recommended that a fee of \$100 could be charged for all preservation applications, with a proposed sliding scale of fees to be applied if a project returned to the commission for a waiver of the demo delay. It was acknowledged by staff and the Commission that repeat reviews of the same historic property were more costly to the city due to increased staff time spent on them.

515 Dudley Road - Demolition Review



Request to demolish house

The owners of this house called staff on the day of the hearing to request that their agenda item be pushed back to the July meeting due to their inability to attend the hearing. Staff agreed to place this address on the July agenda.

108 Shady Hill Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Tim Porter, design builder for this property, presented this project on behalf of the owner, Sum Yue Lee, who was present with her husband. The owners loved the location but the current house was too small for their mother to join them in the household. The owners wished to demolish the house and build a new one. Commission members noted that the street was, architecturally, largely still intact and that the current house fit with the historic neighborhood context.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1947 and had only one building permit issued, and it was for its construction by owner/builder Charles C. Nordone. The house was a two-story side-entrance Colonial with an attached single-story garage. By at least 1974 Mary E. Friree and her husband, a technician at WBZ TV owned the house. In 2002 the house was sold to the current owner. Though windows were replaced and the house was vinyl sided, the house retained its massing and 1940s appearance in a relatively intact neighborhood of similar architectural examples. Staff therefore recommended the house be preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 108 Shady Hill Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Negative

Voting in the Affirmative:

Mark Armstrong, Member
Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

23-25 Troy Lane - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner, Kristen Lenhart, stated it was the owners' belief that the two-family house she owned with her husband did not meet zoning code for setbacks and that the new building they proposed for the site would respect current zoning. The owners were told that zoning was not an NHC consideration at this early stage, and that the house must first be determined to be preferably preserved for historic reasons. The owners presented that eight of the 16 homes on the street were two-family, and that four others had already been replaced on the street. The owners also stated repeatedly that the current house was non-conforming and they thought this was relevant. They also argued that the neighborhood was in transition and was losing its historic context.

Staff reported that this Colonial Revival house first appeared on insurance maps in 1929, and was owned by Mrs. Florence E. Manson. Permits were issued in 1925 to build the house with a two car garage, as the house was built originally as a two-family. In 1955 the house was owned by Hector Priestley, chauffer, who appeared to continue to own the building until 1994 when it was purchased by Robert and Barbara Paven. The house retained its massing and two-unit appearance, with rafter tails and a carriage shed that appeared to be original to the property. The house was

located on a street of 1920s housing of similar massing and orientation. An exception to this was the historic c.1830 house located across the street, which appeared to have been the earliest structure on Troy Lane. The south end of the street was also largely intact. Staff recommended that the property be preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-3:

RESOLVED to find the building at 23-25 Troy Lane **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:Voting in the NegativeAbstainedRodney Barker, MemberMark Armstrong, MemberBill Roesner, MemberDave Morton, Acting ChairLaura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The motion did not pass, so the house is not preferably preserved..

49 Pelham Street

Request to demolish house

This item was not heard next on the agenda because no owners were present. Items listed after it on the agenda were heard in its stead. This item became ninth on the agenda, though there were still no owners present.

45 Curve Street, NR - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The current owner of the house, Hollis Perry, told the Commission that he had grown up in the Myrtle Baptist neighborhood, and although acknowledging that this was a house in a National Register district he did not want a delay imposed on the demolition of his house for health and financial reasons.

Staff reported that this house was listed on the National Register of Historic Places as part of the Myrtle Baptist Church Historic District. This Cape Style house was first located on the 1907 insurance map and owned by B.E. Kemp. Prior to the construction of this house, the land was originally owned by Fred Brillemare. Residents living in the house in 1907 were Fred Harrington, John Holmes, laborer, and David Smith, laborer. By 1917 the house was owned by Amanda M. Clark, and occupied by Catherine Wheeler, Timothy Lawson, laborer, and Tiny Houston, butler. In 1913 a building permit was issued to add one room and change the house to a two-family residence. Amanda Clark continued to own the house through 1929. Saul Perry, a laborer, owned the house as of 1948, and the Perry family continued its ownership of the house to the current day. Due to the fact that the house was listed on the National Register, staff recommended that the house be preferably preserved with an 18-month demo delay imposed.

The neighbor at 41 Curve Street, Mr. Ferguson, commented that he wanted more transparency on the principals involved with this commission, and that he was opposed to this demolition for now.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved, with an 18-month delay imposed. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the National Register –listed building at 45 Curve Street **preferably preserved** with an 18-month delay imposed.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

22-24 River Avenue – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and outbuilding

Lawrence Lee, attorney for Ward Shifman, presented Shipman's plans to demolish the two buildings on this parcel. Commission members discussed how the scale of the neighborhood was in keeping with these two buildings and that the builder was encouraged to preserve them.

Staff reported that the house was located on the south side of Elliot Street next door to 8-10 Keefe Avenue (to the west, see next item), and that this property was comprised of a multi-family house built c.1840 according to the Assessors database, and a shed. The shed did not appear to be historic. A building permit for what was a 1923 garage on the property listed the date of the house as 1873, a date which was more in keeping with the architectural style of the house. This house was one of the oldest on the street and possibly the neighborhood. In 1875 this house stood to the south and across the street from the Newton Cotton Mills buildings on Elliot Street, and was owned by Ed. Kanane. This was also the only house on what later became River Avenue and Chandler Place, before the latter was renamed Keefe Avenue in around 1900. In 1895, Ed. Kannane continued to own this house. Mary Kannane owned the house in 1907. In 1917 the house and lot were owned by Giulio DeMichele, likely the same family who purchased the lot at 10 Keefe Avenue to the west in 1962. Given the date and location of this house in one of the oldest manufacturing neighborhoods in Newton, staff recommended this house be preferably preserved for architectural significance and for historic context.

Nina Koch, a resident of Upper Falls, and Isabel Albeck, a resident of Windsor Road, supported finding this property preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the buildings at 22-24 River Avenue **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

8-10 Keefe Avenue - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Lawrence Lee, attorney for Ward Shipman, presented Shipman's plans to demolish the two houses on this parcel. Commission members discussed how the scale of the neighborhood was in keeping with these two buildings and that the builder was encouraged to preserve them. Staff informed the Commission that one of the two houses on this parcel was a 1998 modular and that it was exempt from this Commission's review.

Staff reported that there were two connected buildings on this lot. The northernmost building was a modular home from Kane Construction installed in 1998, which did not qualify as historic under the Demo Delay Ordinance. The red Cape Style house connected to the modular building on the south side was constructed c.1962 and was converted to a two-family house the same year. The first owner of the house was Richard DeMichele, who bought the house as designed by Donald Leonard of Craftwood Builders. The houses to the south of these two on the street were predominantly older, from c.1910 to the 1920s. This Cape Style house was a later example of this style in Newton, and as such was not a rare example. Many of the houses on this street were older and largely intact, which made this Cape house a later intrusion rather than a contextual addition to the neighborhood. Staff recommended that the house be found not preferably preserved.

Commission members disagreed, and found the Cape house to be in keeping with the context of the neighborhood.

Armstrong made a motion to find the property preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the buildings at 8-10 Keefe Avenue **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

49 Pelham Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owners of this property were not present.

Staff reported that this Italianate Style house had an assessed construction date of 1880, and an Engineering Dept date of 1835. Though Italianate houses were found in Newton as early as the 1840s, there was no other evidence to suggest this was one was built earlier than 1850. This house first appeared on an 1856 map of Newton under the owner name of Jennings. On the 1874 atlas, the owner appeared as H.F. Russell. On the 1886 atlas, Hiram Russell, a dentist, still owned the house, and his wife appeared as owner in 1914 when she obtained a permit to update the plumbing. By 1939, J.E. Cummings, clergyman, owned the house. In 1949 the house was owned by Oiva E. Hintsa, engineer, who in 1960 obtained a permit to 'lengthen windows in bay, connect exiting porch roofs, enclose existing porch with glass; and concrete foundation to existing bay.' Mr. Hintsa owned the house until at least 1968.

The house retained Italianate features in its upper stories, with an end-gable roof, paired brackets, and an arched central gable window and returns. The first floor saw more modern alterations, with the loss of the original front porch, removal of windows and replacement with clerestory windows on the north side, and vertical siding. Other houses in the neighborhood were of similar massing, though many were built in the 1920s, making this one of the oldest houses on the street. Staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Bill Knight, the abutter at 55 Pelham Street, said he wanted to see the house destroyed. He said the latest owners had Scandinavian-ized the house to the point where it was no longer a viable Italianate structure. Mr. Knight said that all of the historic detail that was once in the house was gone, and that it was in very poor condition. He also said the landscaping was beautiful and that he hoped it would be retained. Carol Schaeffer, and abutter on Pleasant Street, said she thought the house should not be preserved but the landscaping should. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road said she thought the house and the barn could be brought back.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the property preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the buildings at 49 Pelham Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

67 Arlington Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Yuriy Matskevich, owner of this property, told the Commission he wanted to demolish the house because it was not in good shape. He acknowledged it was a nice looking property but said he could replace it with something better.

Staff reported that this Mansard roofed house was standing at this location as early as 1874, but the name of the earliest owner was hard to discern. By 1886, the house was owned by Marcellus P. Springer, a Boston commuter. The house at one time had a slate roof and 2/2 windows, but even with the loss of these materials the house retains its bell cast roof, shallow gabled dormers, bay windows and overall massing. This house does not appear to have been owner-occupied since c.1900. From at least 1913 until c.1960, the house was owned by Frank and Nora Sullivan, who it appeared to have never lived in the house but rented it to family members and tenants. By 1964 the house was owned by Peter Dunne, who, like Frank Sullivan, did not appear in directories. In 1965 Robert Dickey owned the house, whose name appears on building permits but not in directories. In 2005, under the ownership of Geoff Epstein, an insurance claim was filed for physical damage to building. Due to the retention of its architectural integrity, staff recommends that the house be found preferably preserved.

Commission members discussed the fact that it was an architecturally significant Mansard style house, and told the owner that it was proposed demolitions such as these that pushed the Newton Aldermen to want to extend the demolition delay period. Mr. Matskevich asked whether he could rebuild the house as it currently appeared using all new materials. The Commission told him that was not what they were voting on this evening. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road stated that the house should be preserved.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 67 Arlington Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

182 Beethoven Avenue - Partial Demolition Review

Request to demolish north ell

Yuriy Matskevich, owner of this property, told the Commission he wanted to retain the oldest portion of the house and remove the 1980s north side ell. As a partial demolition, this project was found preferably preserved at the April 2014 meeting and was eligible to return to subsequent NHC meetings for approval. The owner presented incomplete plans for the new additions at the May 2014 meeting and was asked to return with more detailed plans.

Staff reported in April that the house was built in 1880, but did not appear on atlases until 1917 and was one of the first ten or so houses on the street. The property was owned in 1907 by Daniel Morgan, but when a house was built on the lot it was owned by John Martin, gardener, and his family until at least 1948. The house reportedly sustained damage to its piazza and north ell during the Hurricane of 1938. A large ell was added to the house in 1982. In 1960 the house was owned by the last name Meinhart; in 1975, the Voros family owned the house and continues their ownership to this day. Most of the houses located in the immediate vicinity of this house have been either torn down and replaced, or altered. This neighborhood no longer retained its early 20th century historic architectural context, yet this house appeared to be one of the last Colonial Revival homes in the neighborhood. Staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Commission members discussed the merits of the revised plans and told the owner they were an improvement over the last iteration. A Commission member said he wanted the owner to avoid installing large garage doors and wanted to see a detailed list of proposed materials. The owner told the Commission that vinyl and aluminum siding currently on the house will come off, and that cedar shingles will sheathe the house instead.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver to the demo delay subject to a list of conditions (see below). Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay for partial demolition on 182 Beethoven Avenue with the following conditions: that the proposed garage doors appear as separate doors; that the siding be cedar wood; that the trim, including shutters and entryways, be of wood; that architectural shingles be used on the roof; that the window fenestration be 6/6 with Anderson 400 series windows; that Azek may be used at the water table; that historic details on the main house block be preserved where possible and that these details be replicated on the new addition; and that new dormer detail on the addition match that of the historic dormer on the historic house.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

69 Clifton Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Robert Curatola, owner of this property and associated with Blue Fin Investments, told the Commission that he had done work in Newton and that this was the first time he had come before the NHC. He also said the house at this address needed work and that he was hired to sell the house with a delay on it.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1951, and that this Ranch Style house was located in a neighborhood of similarly designed and sited ranch houses. Designed by Lester Lechter for Home Builders, Inc., this house was built in 1953. Its first owner was Edward Redstone, who in 1959 obtained a building permit to add a single room rear addition. In 1968 the house was owned by John Negrotti, a fire fighter. A new rear deck was added in 1992. Due to the fact that houses in the immediate vicinity of this house were either intact ranch style homes or were altered in such a way as to preserve their horizontal orientation and neighborhood context, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for context.

Commission members discussed the house in the context of its neighborhood and agreed that the context had been preserved in this case.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 69 Clifton Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

91-93 Halcyon Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Paul Sullivan, owner of the house, acquired it from his father of the same name. Paul Sullivan senior purchased the house in the 1950s and housed his family there. In 1962 he turned it into a three-family house. He now wanted to demolish the building.

Staff reported that this multi-family worker's cottage was reported to date to 1880, but insurance maps show no sign of this house and outbuilding until 1907. This lodging house was owned and built by Charles C. Stearns (b.1851), listed on census records as a laborer and milkman. Charles was the son of John Stearns, who lived at 144 Clark Street and ran a dairy farm on land north and south of what is now Route 9. Platted as Halcyon Street near the turn of the century, the land along this road was owned by Charles' mother. Charles Stearns' principal residence was at 111 Clark Street, a high style Italianate house located one block east of this house. Charles' wife, Mary E. Stearns, immigrated to this country from England in 1860. The Stearns appear on census records for this address until 1932, when this cottage was held by the estate of C.C. Stearns. Their daughter Maude owned this cottage and the family homestead on Clark Street through the 1950s until the worker's cottage was sold in the late 1950s to Paul Sullivan, president of Sullivan & Sons. This worker house was likely associated with the Stearns dairy farm on Clark Street, and is one of the oldest houses on Halcyon Road. This house is also unique in its use as worker housing, as all other buildings on the street appear to have been built as

single family homes. Staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity, historic neighborhood context, and its association with the Stearns farm on Clark Street.

Commission members discussed the fact that the side-by-side orientation of the house differentiated it from the rest of the neighborhood and that it lacked architectural detail, but its association with the agricultural history of the neighborhood added to its significance.

Barker made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 91-93 Halcyon Road **preferably preserved** for historic neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

15 Margaret Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner of the house, Jerry Demirgian, spoke about growing up in the house and that it had been altered over the years. The front porch was removed, the side door taken off, bathrooms added, and two-room additions on the house changed its historic character. He also said the house had been in the family for 50 years and that no amount of adding onto it would make the house worth keeping. He also cited financial and health reasons for his decision to demolish the house.

Staff reported that the house was built c.1900, and that it first appeared on insurance maps in 1907 when Margaret Street was first platted. The name A.S. Robertson (and later, his family) appeared before 1908 as the owner, but from 1909 through to at least 1940, Martha Robertson appeared as the solo home owner with her daughters as boarders, one of whom was Margaret. Phillip Butler appeared as owner in 1917, with Martha Robertson as a boarder. Martha then appeared as owner again on the 1929 insurance map 1929. In 1953, Ralph E. Hutchins, a machinist at Needham Manufacturing, owned the house. A garage was built onsite during his ownership in 1963. From approximately 1970 on, Khachik Demirgian, repairman for Albany Carpet, owned the property with his family up until 2013. Though the house has been sheathed in vinyl siding and the windows have been replaced, the house likely retained much of its original sheathing detail under the siding, and the house had retained its overall massing and form. As such, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved as one of the oldest houses on the street.

Commission members commented that the house could be renovated and that it had nice lines and historic massing that appeared to be largely intact.

Barker made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 15 Margaret Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.



Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

17 Duane Avenue - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Charles Calhoun, architect, and the owner Richard Saris, presented their plan to demolish this small worker cottage. Mr. Saris told the Commission it was the family home, and that when his mother died she gave him permission to tear it down and build something new on the site. The owner said the foundation was cracked and the house was in general disrepair.

Staff reported that this workers cottage, which was one of three built at the end of this cul de sac, was built in 1900 on land owned by John A. Duane, a second-generation Irishman married to Ella and the father of at least seven children. Duane was the store keeper of a grocery store. Duane Avenue was platted c.1900 when these cottages first appeared on the 1907 insurance map. In 1901, two of the three cottages were occupied by laborers, but the third was vacant. John Duane continued to own these properties until at least 1929, and rented them to workers. In 1903, the boarders were William and T.L. Jackson, teamsters. In 1909, Mrs. Theresa Clinton was listed as the boarder. From the 1930s to the 1950s, the house was occupied by laborers until the house was purchased in the early 1960s by George and Carmela Saris, a landscape gardener. The Saris family is the last owner of record. This small, 1.5 story Cape Style house stands on a rubble stone foundation with wood siding and an interior end-chimney. Windows have been replaced but appear to be in their original openings. As part of a small worker-cottage enclave, staff recommended that this house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Commission members found the house at #17 and the group of three buildings to have significance as an early workers cottage development in Newton.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 17 Duane Avenue **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice. Alternate

17 Regina Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Charles Calhoun again presented on behalf of the owner to remove the house and replace it with something more in keeping with other two-story Colonials in the neighborhood.

Staff reported that the original building permit for this Ranch Style house is on file with ISD, and showed the house was built in 1951. Sarah Monahan was listed as the owner, Holmes & Edwards were the architects, and Murray Burke was the builder. Holmes& Edwards was still in business in Quincy, having opened their business in 1948. Monahan was still living there in 1961, but by 1975 the owner was Mary Nally. Elizabeth Gallagher, owner of the house in 1996, enclosed the porch on the house, and remodeled the kitchen in 1994. This ranch was one story with a central entrance and with what appeared to be original trim detail, and was centered on its lot. This neighborhood contained a mix of two-story Colonials, capes, and a few ranches, all of which appeared to be original. This was the only ranch in this cul de sac, but was consistent in age and massing to other houses in the neighborhood. Staff therefore recommended the house be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Commission members discussed whether there was historic context for this particular house in the neighborhood.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Morton seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-3:

RESOLVED to find the building at 17 Regina Road not preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member

Rodney Barker, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The motion did not pass, so the house was found to be preferably preserved.

11 Lake Terrace - Demolition Review

Request to demolish garage

Osnat Levi presented on the behalf of the owner and told the Commission that the house originally associated with this outbuilding burned a long time ago and that only this building remained. Two adjacent lots at the end of this cul de sac were to be combined and sold as one lot.

Staff reported that the only structure currently standing on this parcel was this carriage house, the last vestige of a property where a c.1900 house once stood. Destroyed almost fifty years ago, the house was removed but the carriage house was apparently left standing. The parcel remained otherwise vacant. Insurance maps showed no sign of this cul de sac or house and carriage house until 1907, when it was owned by Jessie M. and William Merrill, a manufacturer in metals until at least 1929. By 1940 Jessie lived here as a widow. By 1947 the house was owned by Walnut Realty Trust, and in 1949 by James Munro, a shipping rep. In 1965, Mr. Munro was given permission to raze the dwelling on this lot. The carriage house was one story with a hipped roof and later addition of a garage door on the south side. A pedestrian door and triple window of diamond pane glass faced the west toward Lake Avenue. Due to the historic nature and context of this carriage house, which was consistent in age with surrounding houses in this residential neighborhood, staff recommended that the carriage house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Commission members discussed the fact that the context for this carriage house appeared to have been lost, and that not enough historic fabric remained to warrant its preservation.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-1:

RESOLVED to find the building at 11 Lake Terrace **not preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Rodney Barker left the meeting after this vote.

14 Charlemont Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Doug Medvetz, partner in a realty group, told the Commission he wanted to build a bigger house on the lot.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1924, with the original permit still on file with ISD. This Bungalow Style house was small in stature and appeared to have been minimally altered. A garage was also built the same year. John R. Egan was the first owner of record, and H.H. Elkins served as both architect and builder. In 1949 the owner was Mrs. Console, and in 1954 it was Frank Console. By 1960, it was Thomas Console. This hipped roof, one story had a combination of paired and sash windows and a slightly off center front entrance. This neighborhood was in transition and thus did not support a historic context for this house. Staff therefore recommended that this house be found not preferably preserved.

Commission members agreed with the loss of context in this neighborhood. Nina Koch of Upper Falls said she liked the smaller cottages in this neighborhood. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road said she felt this little house was in context with other little houses in the area.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1:

RESOLVED to find the building at 14 Charlemont Street **not preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

731 Beacon Street - Demolition Review

Request for demolition of house

Gary L. Irving, resident of one unit in this house and trustee for the property, presented his plan to demolish his family home. Mr. Irving said the inside stairs are becoming too steep and the bathroom is on the third floor.. All utilities in the house were substandard, he said, and renovation was not an option. Four letters of support for keeping the house were read into the record.

Staff reported that this Colonial Revival Style house was built after 1901 and appeared on the 1907 insurance map. One of its earliest owners was named George E. Lowcock, a chauffeur in Brookline who was listed as owner of the house through at least 1929. In 1924, he constructed a one car garage on the property. In 1945, Clemens Spang, another chauffer, lived in the house. By 1950 the house was owned by Dr. Eliot Irving, owner and operator of Brass Sidney Chiropractic, which he appeared to operate out of this building. Dr. Irving's home address in 1953 was 44 Puritan Road. In 1961, the building was vacant, but the house appeared to have stayed in the Irving family until at least 2000. Though in need of maintenance, the house retained its original massing, shingling, and architectural detail and as such, staff recommended the house be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context.

Commission members encouraged the owner to consider restoration of the house as an intact, albeit tired, example of historic architecture near an urban core.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 731 Beacon Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative:
Mark Armstrong, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Bill Roesner, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Voting in the Negative Abstaine

100 Evelyn Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Timothy Burke, architect for the owners Mr. and Mrs. Gregor at this address, wanted to add space to their house as an in-law apartment. The attached side garage would be removed and a rear second story addition would be added over a new garage at the front of the property.

Staff reported that this house was constructed in 1950 and owned by Hyman and Sylvia Horwitz, (sales manager at Grossman's) who continued to own the house in 1971. By 1998, the house was owned by the current owners. In 2002, permits were issued for a rear addition and kitchen remodel. Hyman Horowitz died in 1995. This house was surveyed as part of the Mid-20th century Housing Survey, which identified this neighborhood as being cohesive in the following ways: rectangular brick chimneys, and that chimney locations tended to be on the exterior end wall nearest the picture window (location of living room) or between the living room and a lateral addition. Houses also tended to be one or two bays deep and four or five bays across, with the entry in the second bay, flanked by the living room picture window on one side and two bedroom windows on the other. Most houses had three bedrooms. All houses had attached garages, located in lateral wings adjacent to the main block, or integral garages beneath a portion of the living space. Though

having undergone some changes over time, this house retained many of the features listed above. As such, staff recommended that it be found preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Commission members discussed whether there was enough neighborhood context to find this house preferably preserved, and the fact that sometimes additions can do more harm than good. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road encouraged the owners to find a way to add to the house rather than demolish it.

Armstrong made a motion to find that house not preferably preserved, but no one seconded the motion. Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context. Morton seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1:

RESOLVED to find the building at 100 Evelyn Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The architect presented plans for a second floor addition behind a new garage on the south side of the house to add living space for an elderly parent. He also told the Commission this project would require a special permit. Commission members commented that the horizontal flavor of the street might be compromised by this design. Others said there was something aggressive about the garage being built in the front yard. The architect explained that the garage jutted forward to accommodate an interior stairway. Architects on the Commission suggested ways in which the stair could be moved and the garage set back further on the lot so as to be less obtrusive. They also requested that a shed roof top the garage opening as opposed to a gabled roof in order to enhance horizontality. Timothy Burke agreed to return to the Commission with revised plans. A waiver to the demo delay was not granted at this time.

236 Waban Avenue - Demolition Review

Request to demolish garage and portion rear facade

Mike McKay, architect for the proposed project at this address, presented the owners' plan to remove the garage on the property in preparation for a rear addition, and remove a portion of the rear façade of the house.

Staff reported that though the construction date was reportedly 1875, no evidence of this house was found on 1886 insurance maps. The house first appeared on maps in 1895, owned by Allston Real Estate. Surprisingly, this Colonial Revival house had not been previously surveyed. The house retained most, if not all of its original architectural detail, shingling, and asymmetry, all of which were hallmarks of the Colonial Revival Style. Though the building file at ISD contained a permit for a garage on this property in 1919, the current garage is obviously of later construction, c.1940. The current proposal is to remove the garage and a portion of the rear façade for the construction of an attached garage. By 1907, the owner was Maud L. Rice, wife of a salesman, who owned the house through the 1920s. In 1927 the house was sold to D. Winslow Hanscom, a musical conductor in Worcester, who did not own the house for very long. The Alan Goodman family (an attorney) owned the house from the 1930s to the 1970s. Staff recommended that the garage be found not preferably preserved, and the house to be found preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Armstrong made a motion to find the garage not preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-1:

RESOLVED to find the garage at 236 Waban Avenue **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 236 Waban Avenue **preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

25 Old Farm Road - Partial Demolition Review

Request to demolish the roof at rear

The architect for this property presented revised plans to add a rear addition on this house. This property was found preferably preserved at the April 2014 meeting, but revised plans presented at that meeting were not approved for a waiver of the demo delay. At that time, the addition was found to be too large for the massing and design of the house and the Commission requested that it be lowered to match the existing ridgepole and be less visible from the front of the property.

Staff reported that this high style pre-war Modern Traditional house was constructed in 1937 in a neighborhood of other large homes from this period. Many have since undergone additions and alterations. This house had a rear screen porch added in 1996 and updates to bathrooms, but aside from those changes the house remained architecturally intact. Directories do not show an owner in 1938, but John E. Warner, vice-president of Buxbaum Company Incorporated lived there in 1945. By 1961 the house was owned by Arthur Karol, a structural engineer. By 1975 the house was owned by Dean Doner, a professor at Boston University. The house was little altered since its construction and was once a pre-war Modern aesthetic, which was in transition on this street. It was staff's recommendation that this house be found preferably preserved.

Commission members debated the merits of the revised design in relation to the size of the proposed rear dormers, overhang of the gable, and whether columns under the overhang might be more appropriate.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demolition delay on this property with the condition that the rear side dormers be 4 feet from the gable end, and porch columns be added beneath the rear overhang. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 25 Old Farm Road with the following conditions: that the rear side dormers be four feet from the rear gable end, and porch columns be added beneath the rear overhang.



Mark Armstrong, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

125 Webster Street, NR - Demolition Review

Request for partial demo of rear façade and garage

At the April 2014 meeting of this Commission, this property was found preferably preserved. This house is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and as such an 18-month delay was imposed on the house. The owner returned to the May hearing with plans for a partial demolition (e.g. a rear addition), but no waiver was approved.

At the April meeting, Staff reported that this house was located in a National Register Historic District and was built c.1860 in the Italianate Style. The end-gable structure with returns faced Webster Street, with an arched window in the gable that was emblematic of the Italianate Style. The front veranda on the house was a later addition and was built in the Queen Anne style, likely from the 1880s. Mrs. Charles May a widow and Lydia Dodge, a local grammar school teacher owned the house in 1874. Due to the house's location in a National Register district and the fact that it retained its historical context, massing and detail, staff recommended that the house be found preferably preserved.

John DePaulus and Michael McKay, architect for the owner, presented plans for side-by-side rectangular units that had architectural details that sought to emulate the existing Italianate structure. After some discussion, the neighbors of this property, both of whom were architects, presented a proposed alternative that was universally accepted, including by Mr. McKay, as an improved site plan over what was being proposed. Mr. McKay returned to the Commission with a revised plan that was more in keeping with the neighbor's ideas, and that preserved the house, pediments, and added shutters. The proposed addition would recede from the historic house on the site. Brackets would be added to the front elevations only, and the new additions will be lowered in relation to the historic house. The long shed dormer on the east elevation of the main house would also be removed. Discussion ensued as to how a topo plan might affect this design.

Eric Finemore of 19 Webster Place was concerned that the driveway access to this property would be removed from Webster and rerouted to Webster Place, adding traffic and a potential hazard to neighborhood children. Another abutter who lived behind this house to the north also expressed this concern.

Commission members expressed their support for the project and were encouraged by the architect's willingness to work with the neighborhood on this design. Other members wished to see the topo map for the lot once it was completed to see how gradations on the site might affect the design.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demolition delay on this property with the condition of additional setbacks at the garage to be increased; that the second floor window on the east side closest to Webster Street be lengthened; and that the front yard parking area be removed from the earlier plan. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 125 Webster Street with the following conditions: that setbacks at the garage be increased; that the second floor window on the east side closest to Webster Street be lengthened; and that the front yard parking area be removed from the earlier plan.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member



Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

34 Larchmont Avenue - Demolition Review

Request for waiver of demo delay

Robert Murray presented his proposed designs for a replacement structure at this address. The four month period since this property was found to be preferably preserved has elapsed, and Mr. Murray returned at his first opportunity to get the demo delay waived for a full demolition of the house.

At the February 2014 meeting, Staff reported that the house was built in 1930, and that this shingled Tudor Revival Style house was built by John R. Elander, who is listed in permits as the owner, architect and builder. Arthur King, an accountant, was its first occupant in 1932. In 1957 the house was sold to Michael Panella, engineer at the State House in Boston, and he owned the house until January of this year. With the exception of a rear mud room addition, this house appeared to be architecturally intact in its massing, Tudor-style banding in the front gable, asymmetrical design, and front entry bay. This house was located in a neighborhood of largely intact 1930s single-family houses, with two other Tudor Revival homes found at 48 and 54 Larchmont. Staff therefore recommended that the house to be preferably preserved for architecture and historical neighborhood context.

Four letters in support of the demolition and replacement of the house, including one from Fred Balfour who four months ago did not support demolition of the house, were read into the record at the hearing.

Mr. Murray presented a plan that he believed incorporated architectural design elements from the current house into the new one. He also told the Commission that the house conformed to all zoning requirements for the lot. At this time he was not sure how tall the structure would be and what the overall square footage was, but that the house was to be cedar shingled. Fieldstone walls would be built where needed and the fence would also be cedar stockade. Neighbors were in agreement on the design elements and Mr. Murray promised to work with them as the project proceeded.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demolition delay on 34 Larchmont Avenue and to approve plans as submitted. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 34 Larchmont Avenue and to approve the plans as submitted.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

93 Bellevue Street, NR, PR - Partial Demolition Review

Request to move existing garage and demo portion of rear facade

The owners and their architect proposed their plan to move the existing garage to the east side of the lot, and remove a portion of the rear façade for an attached garage and additional living space.

Staff reported that this house did not appear on the 1874 insurance map, but did appear by 1886 with a detached garage, owned by Job A. Turner. The original house was reportedly built in the Queen Anne Style and was heavily

altered in 1888 by Charles Riley, a manufacturer of cotton processing machinery, who sought a more Classical Revival appearance. By 1895 the house was owned by Agnes A. Riley, and an outbuilding at the rear of the lot was now associated with 99-109 Bellevue, which was owned by Charles E. Riley. Charles Riley became the owner of 93 Bellevue Street c.1900 and obtained a building permit to construct another outbuilding in 1904, of brick or stone. The Riley family owned the house until at least 1971. Mr. Nadoff purchased the house by 1972. In the 1980s the carriage house contained apartments, and was subdivided from this lot to contain housing units. As part of this project, a preservation restriction was imposed on the 93 Bellevue lot. Due to the fact that this house is listed on the National Register of Historic Places and has a PR, staff recommends this house be found preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find 93 Bellevue Street preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to find 93 Bellevue Street **preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

The architect described the owners' plans to save the existing detached garage by moving it to the east side of the lot and use it for parking or storage. The existing driveway would also be rerouted from the west side of the lot, which is shared with the neighboring property, to the east side of the lot. The proposed rear attached garage addition on the main house used similar materials to the main house, with pigmented stucco to match the existing as well as Milford pink granite, which was also used on the main house. The roof would also be of copper standing seam. Commission members held a brief discussion.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay on 83 Bellevue Street and accept the plans as submitted. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay at 93 Bellevue Street and accept the plans as submitted.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

115 Park Street, NR - Partial Demolition Review

Request to remove portion rear facade

Scott Lewis, designer, and Steve Gagnon, owner, presented their plan to remove the rear façade of the house in preparation for an addition, and remove and re-pour a foundation for the main house.

Staff reported that the property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1982 as part of the Farlow and Kenrick Parks Historic District, and that this house was erected c. 1870 and stands across the street from the Bigelow School. The unique bell cast Mansard roof is intact, with an unusual projecting front wing creating a T plan. The

aluminum siding was to be removed as part of this project, which included a two and a half story addition off the rear of the building. This house was occupied from 1868 to 1905 by S.W. Holmes, a merchant in Boston, and subsequently owned by Lydia H. Holmes. Because the owner was presenting plans for a partial demolition (e.g. a rear addition), the proposed plans were reviewed. This house was one of many Mansard homes lining Park Street. As a National Register listed property, staff recommended that it be preferably preserved.

Roesner made a motion to find 15 Park Street preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on June 26, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0:

RESOLVED to find 115 Park Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Mark Armstrong, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Bill Roesner, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Commission members reviewed the proposed plans for a rear addition on the building. Concerns were expressed about the faux mansard style roof that was proposed for the rear addition, and the fact that it did not match the bell cast profile of the existing mansard roof. The massing of the addition was also discussed, as was the proposed plan to lower the historic building onto a new foundation that was set lower in the ground than the current stone foundation. The owner did not have an explanation for why he wanted the house to be set lower on the lot.

Jay Walter, 83 Pembroke Street, expressed his concern about the faux mansard roof, the dormers flush with the façade below, and that the scale of the proposed dormers did not match the existing house. He also had concerns about the existing grading issues with the site, and wanted to see historic architectural detail on the house to be restored. The owner said he wanted to pour a new concrete foundation and not sheathe it as it would not be visible from a public way. Commission members were not in support of this plan.

The owner and designer were asked to incorporate the Commission's and abutters concerns regarding the proposed designs and foundation plan, and to return to a subsequent hearing. No waiver to the delay was granted.

Administrative Items:

Minutes from the May meeting were unanimously approved by a 4-0 vote. The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 12:40 a.m.

Katy Hax Holmes Commission Staff